

LOK SATTA
(Peoples Power)
www.loksatta.org

MINUTES OF THE MEETING HELD ON 15.08.2005
IN THE PREMISES OF ST. XAVIER'S SCHOOL,
VILE PARLE [EAST], MUMBAI, AT 10 A.M.

Agenda: Empowerment of Mumbai City Municipal Government & Making it Accountable Directly to People by Peoples Participation in City Governance.

1. The Meeting was convened by Loksatta, Maharashtra Chapter. All the concerned citizens and lovers of Mumbai City were invited. The Meeting was well attended by several active and concerned citizens of Mumbai. The list of Participants is enclosed.
2. The Meeting was mainly called – [a] to analyse what was wrong with the Municipal Governance System in Mumbai and proposed solutions by Loksatta, Maharashtra Chapter; and [b] to decide the method for resolution of various problems associated with slums and slum-dwellers in Mumbai.
- 3.0. Municipal Governance:
 - 3.1. After the 'introductory remarks' and with the help of 'Power-Point Presentation', it was firstly explained, what was wrong with the present system of 'governance', which, according to the analysis of Loksatta, would usually result in lack of governance or mis-governance.
 - 3.2. Under the present structure of governance, the policy-making authority was vested in the "Corporation" consisting of 227 Corporators elected from 'Corporator Wards' by method of 'simple majority of votes' (FPTP System). However, the powers of executing the policies and administration were vested in the Commissioner, who was 'appointee' of the State Government.
 - 3.3. Besides these, there were other authorities like Airports Authority of India, Railways, MTNL, Port Trust, and MMRDA, MHADA etc., who also were free to do as they pleased with their properties situated within the area of operation of BMC or while executing the powers in respect of activities falling within their scope. The BMC had absolutely no control over these authorities. Thus, in the present system of governance, the policy makers had no authority to execute its policies; the executor of the policies was not responsible for making of the policies; and complete freedom

was given to other authorities like Railways etc. to interfere with or intervene in the functions over which, the BMC alone should have the control and authority of operation. This resulted in complete failure of governance, with each faction being free to pass on the buck to the other. The result was, that there was absolutely no accountability and no answer to the question - who is responsible? However, the above observation was not meant to suggest that these other authorities' domain over their subject matters be taken away or curtailed in any way. What was required was close working co-operation and unity in command where the activities of these authorities involved doing something in the BMC's area of operation & *BMC's word shall be final in the matter of Municipal Issues.*

3.4 Another difficulty was that the people of Mumbai have no control over the Chief Executive i.e. Commissioner. In the event, the Commissioner fails to faithfully execute the policies laid down by the Corporation, there is nothing to which Mumbai stakeholders can take recourse to, except, may be approaching the Court of Law. In that event, the policy makers cannot be held responsible, if their policies were not executed. There was no 'devolution of authority' and power to the Ward Committees, who were formed under compulsion of the 74TH AMENDMENT TO THE CONSTITUTION OF INDIA. However, instead of forming the Ward Committees for each Corporator Ward, the BMC has constituted only 16 Ward Committees for 227 Corporator Wards, consisting of Corporators and their nominees. Therefore, the Ward Committees have unmanageable area of operation. Some idea can be had when it is seen that the area of operation within some of the Ward Committees consists of population over 11 lakhs. There is no way that such Ward Committees can ever be held answerable or accountable to the people of Mumbai.

3.5. Loksatta has proposed changes in the structure of 'governance' based on 'devolution' and 'de-centralisation of powers and responsibilities' and making the key positions 'directly elect able' to make them answerable and accountable to the people of Mumbai. The structure proposed was as follows: -

[a] At Macro Level -

It was proposed that the "Mayor" should be directly elected from and by the 'registered voters' in all 227 Corporate Wards. He should be the Chief Executive Officer with full powers of implementing the policies laid down by the "Corporation" consisting of 227 Corporators/Councilors. All the functions (affecting the Municipal Governance) of the other authorities of Centre/State, falling, for execution, within the geographical territory of Mumbai, should either be delegated to the Mayor or should be executable only after prior

consultation and approval of the Mayor. Mayor's word shall be final in all functions affecting the Municipal Governance.

The Mayor would be free to appoint various 'Expert committees' to advise, assist or help him in execution of his functions. The Mayor should also have complete control of the 'Master Development Plan', which, essentially, should be drawn up only by the 'technical experts' taking in to account requirement of Metropolitan Area and should not be changed without the prior consent of the 'Technical Committee'. The Mayor should also be drawing assistance from the "Ward Committees" (including "Area Sabhas"), which should be based on Corporator Wards; in other words, 227 Ward Committees, at present. The Ward Committees would act as the 'Exchange Centers for free exchange of information for execution of policies, of the extent of their implementation, or receiving back most accurate information about the developments within the Wards and bonafide requirements of, and problems faced at, Ward Levels. In effect the Area Sabhas & Ward Committees should have a say in evolving a development plan for the city and the metropolitan region.

[b] At Micro Level -

The focal point at 'Micro Level' would be a Ward Committee consisting of - [a] Elected Corporator/Councilor on 'Proportional Representation' basis, who will be the Chair-person of the Ward Committee; and [b] one representative per Polling Booth elected from each of the Polling Booths in that Ward. The representative elected at the Polling Booth must be a person not associated with any political party and would not be a candidate supported or proposed by any political party. In addition to Ward Committees, registered voters in each polling Booth will constitute the "Area Sabha"; something very similar to 'Gram Sabha'. The 'Area Sabha', either at a meeting or by circular resolution, supported by not less than 10 per cent of the registered voters should have the authority to refer any issue for decision and action of the Ward Committee. The representative elected by the Polling Booth can be recalled, if the Area Sabha passes 'no confidence motion' by majority in a meeting or by a circular resolution. Other functions of area sabha could include assisting in maintenance of correct electoral roles & identifying people below poverty line etc...

Each of the Ward Committees will be provided with 'autonomy' over certain Functions, tasks or responsibilities and will be provided with necessary finances and statutory authority to be responsible and accountable for the tasks or functions, over which the Ward Committees have autonomy. Certain

Functionaries would also be transferred under the accountability & supervision of the ward committee. The Ward Committee will also act as the means of gathering or accessing accurate information about the area covered by the Ward Committee for the Mayor or the Corporation. It will have the power to respond to any development of area under its jurisdiction proposed at 'Macro Level'. If the Ward Committee opposes any proposal at Macro Level, the said Ward Committee should have an opportunity of being heard before finalising the proposal at the Macro Level.

- 3.6. It was then explained that it would be necessary to form 'Mock' Ward Committees in certain selected wards. These mock Ward Committees will have to become active along the lines indicated in the proposed reconstruction of the 'Governance System' for Mumbai. A group will have to take charge in certain Corporator Wards in order to ensure - [a] formation of Ward Committees; [b] obtaining list of 'Registered Voters' and the number of Polling Booths. This Group will have to ensure that there was one representative per polling booth in order to form and constitute a Ward Committee. These Ward Committees would adopt two to three areas of Municipal functions in order to assert their 'relevance'. This Ward Committee would have to undertake the task of creating public awareness to the proposed 'Reconstruction of the Governance System'. Such Ward Committees would be duly supported by LOK SATTA with useful data & detailed analysis regarding their Polling Both Area as well as Corporator Ward Area. Accordingly the offers were invited from those present to take up the responsibility of forming and making functional the Ward Committees, as proposed. Offers for the following Wards were received:

Corporator Ward: 003	Administrative Ward: A
Area: Colaba Market-Museum-Breobourn Stadium	
Address of Corporator	
Shri. Vinod Sitambalam Sekhar Amarchand Mansion, C Block, 1 st Floor, Madam Kama Road, Colaba, Mumbai-001 Phone: 22026545 ® 22842645 (O) 9820356118 (M)	
Volunteer In charge of Survey	
Neera Punj - 98201 57081 Nayana Katpalia- 98202 16623	
Corporator Ward: 32	Administrative Ward: F-South
Area: Raj Kamal Studio-Golanji Hill-Haffkine Institute	

Address of Corporator	
Smt. Samiksha Suresh Paralkar 26/A, Room No:9, Matrukripa building, 1 st Floor, Parel Village, Mumbai-012 Phone: 24163303	
Volunteer In charge of Survey: Surendra Srivastava – 98673 34446	

Corporator Ward: 039	Administrative Ward: F-North
Area: Hindu Colony – Parsi Colony	
Address of Corporator	
Shri. Gordhan Keshav Chauhan Kumbharwada, 4 th Wadi, Dharavi, Mumbai-058 Phone: 24092833 ® 24010877 (O)	
Volunteer In charge of Survey: Joe Lobo – 98330 38950	

Corporator Ward: 041	Administrative Ward: F-North
Area: Lepers Home – Arora Cinema	
Address of Corporator	
Smt. Pratibha Prakash Malvi Vasudeo Sadan, 6 th Lane, Hindu Colony, Dadar, Mumbai-014 Phone: 24155590	
Volunteer In charge of Survey: Joe Lobo – 98330 38950 (another name to be proposed)	

Corporator Ward: 48	Administrative Ward: F-North
Area: Pratiksha Nagar - Sion	
Address of Corporator	
Shri. Mangesh Shridhar Satamakar 193/2075, Kane Nagar, C.G.S. Colony, Sector-6, Antop Hill, Mumbai-080 Phone: 24163303	
Volunteer In charge of Survey: Gaurang Vora – 98692 83516	

Corporator Ward: 062	Administrative Ward: G-North
Area: National Hospital-Mahim Fort	

Address of Corporator	
Smt. Indumati Bhikaji Mangaonkar 5, Mount Clear Co-Op. Soc., 50, Gabriel Path, L. J. Road, Mahim, Mumbai-016 Phone: 24451448 ®	
Volunteer In charge of Survey: Asharaf Ahmed-93235 65996	
Corporator Ward: 064	Administrative Ward: G-North
Area: Dr. Jhaveri Hospital-Mahim Kapad Bazar	
Address of Corporator	
Shri. Prakash Atmaram Ayare A/2, Konkan Nagar, Ground Floor, Lt. Dilip Gupte Marg, Mahim, Mumbai-016 Phone: 24440714 ® 24224887 (O)	
Volunteer In charge of Survey: Bulu Saldhana - 24454674	

Corporator Ward: 73	Administrative Ward: H-West
Area: Mount Mary-Vandre Bazar	
Address of Corporator	
Shri. Alijan Suleman Shaikh 143, Gonsalvis Wadi, 12-Chinchpokli Road, Off Hill Road, Bandra (w), Mumbai-050 Phone: 26400645	
Volunteer In charge of Survey	
Vidya Vaidya – 26408075 ® 98200 20437	

Corporator Ward: 074	Administrative Ward: H-West
Area: Bandra Fort-Pali Market-Bhabha Hospital	
Address of Corporator	
Smt. Kavita Harvi Rodricks 24 A, Ranwar, Flat No:5, 1 st Floor (old 6 B, Paul House), Waroda Road, Bandra (w), Mumbai-050 Phone: 26403554 ® 26410207(O)	
Volunteer In charge of Survey: Shyama Kulkarni - 26427496	

Corporator Ward: 077	Administrative Ward: H/West
Area: Khar Gymkhana, RBI Colony, Sarswat Colony	
Address of Corporator	
Shri. Ashish Babaji Shelar 8, Rose Castle, 289-A, Bazar Road, Bandra (W), Mumbai-050 Phone: 26416848	
Volunteer In charge of Survey	
Goutam Rao – 98210 57171 P. K. Bannerjee – 98206 58997	

Corporator Ward: 90	Administrative Ward: K-East
Area: Vile Parle-Telephone Exchange-Sahar Airport-Sahar Village	
Address of Corporator	
Shri. Tukaram Shabaji Nikam Somnath Sadan Chawl, Sagbaug, Andheri-Kurla Road, Marol, Mumbai-059 Phone: 24118536	
Volunteer In charge of Survey: Ravi Nair and Mr. James - 93240 86140	

Corporator Ward: 092	Administrative Ward: K-East
Area: Parle Tilak Vidyalaya	
Address of Corporator	
Smt. Riddhi Buddhiwan Dhuri Yashwant Chavan Chawl, Room No: 6, M. V. Pandloskar Marg, Vile Parle (E), Mumbai-057 Phone: 28214143 ®	
Volunteer In charge of Survey: Rishi Agarwal – 98206 40324	

Corporator Ward: 94	Administrative Ward: K-East
Area: Chakala South-Yellow Fever Hospital	
Address of Corporator	
Smt. Jyoti Deepak Andhari Manibai Chawl, Dr. Charat Sing Colony, Chakala, Andheri(E), Mumbai--093 Phone: 28262519®	

Volunteer In charge of Survey: Ashok Pai and Mr. James - 93240 86140

Corporator Ward: 106	Administrative Ward: K-West
Area: Juhu Tara-Vile Parle-Juhu Scheme	
Address of Corporator	
Shri. Ashok Bhau Jadhav 114, Dadi Chawl, Irla, S. V. Road, Vile Parle (w), Mumbai-056 Phone: 26711937 ® 26523952 (O)	
Volunteer In charge of Survey: Adolf D'souza - 98199 28707	

Corporator Ward: 108	Administrative Ward: K-West
Area: Gulmohar-TATA colony	
Address of Corporator	
Smt. Shahin Ara Salim Baig Baig Manzil, Gulmohar, Cross Road No:7, Samata Nagar, Andheri (w), Mumbai-058 Phone: 26209538 ® 9821917851 (M)	
Volunteer In charge of Survey Paresh Mehta - 98200 52762 Jagdeep Desai - 98692 27148	
Corporator Ward: 109	Administrative Ward: K-West
Area: Juhu Gaothan-Seven Bunglow	
Address of Corporator	
Smt. Geetha Vasant Yadav Geetha House, Joseph Patel Wadi, Yari Road, Seven Bunglow, Andheri (w), Mumbai-058 Phone: 26324009, 9869009309(M)	
Volunteer In charge of Survey: Anand Desai - 98206 02715	

Corporator Ward: 115	Administrative Ward: K-West
Area: Amboli Hill-Malcolm Baug	

Address of Corporator	
Shri. Vishnu Vasudeo Korgaonkar Room No:7, D'Mello Complex Sarotpada, Veera Desai Marg, Andheri(W), Mumbai-053 Phone: 26763812@	
Volunteer In charge of Survey: Theresa Coelho - 26793445	

Corporator Ward: 141	Administrative Ward: R/South
Area: Kandivili(West)-Iraniwadi	
Address of Corporator	
Shri. Phone:	
Volunteer In charge of Survey	
Ramita Mehta - 98218 78215 And Sandhya Sinha -	

Corporator Ward: 161	Administrative Ward: R-North
Area: Jeevan Bima Nagar - Bhagwati Hospital	
Address of Corporator	
Dr. (smt) Shubha Umesh Raul A-1, 'Amiraj', Dahisar Phatak, Dahisar (E), Mumbai-002 Phone: 28937200, 28914541	
Volunteer In charge of Survey: Indira Bhende - 28954949	

Corporator Ward: 166	Administrative Ward: L
Area: Nehru Nagar-Everard Nagar	
Address of Corporator	
Shri. Rajendra Ramakant Lad 2, Aradhana Building, Vishram Society, Shiv Shrushti, Kurla (E), Mumbai-024 Phone: 25244917@ 25244916 (O)	
Volunteer In charge of Survey: Dr. Vandana Pradeep Phone: 98210 75536	

Corporator Ward: 183	Administrative Ward: M-East
Area: Subhash Nagra – Beggar’s Home	
Address of Corporator	
Smt. Neelam Vikas Dolas 43/1465, Dnyandeep co.op Hsg.Soc, Ground Floor, Subhash Nagar, Principal Mandlecha Si Marg, Chembur, Mumbai-071 Phone: 25503169, 25202423 @ 9820122585 (M)	
Volunteer In charge of Survey: Raj kumar Sharma – 98209 89310	
Corporator Ward: 223	Administrative Ward: T
Area: Mulnd Central	
Address of Corporator	
Shri. Parashuram Gangaram Mirekar 9/A, 101, Sai Shradha CHS, Rohidas Nagar, Ganesh Gawde Rd, Mulund (w), Mumbai-080 Phone: 25913173 @ 25655187(O)	
Volunteer In charge of Survey: Laxmi Das Thakkar Phone: 30911966(0)	

Corporator Ward: 224	Administrative Ward: T
Area: Nane Pada-Palm Acres	
Address of Corporator	
Shri. Prabhakar Tukaram Shinde Laxmi Sadan, 5 th Floor, Flat No: 501, Kesar Baug, Gopal Krishna Gokhale Road, Mulund (E), Mumbai-081 Phone: 25923377 @ 25645385 (O)	
Volunteer In charge of Survey: Chandrakanth Gantha C/o Laxmi Das Thakkar, 30911966(0)	

3.7. The concept being new, there were naturally certain queries and apprehensions, which were partly answered. The various details will have to be worked in close cooperation and consultation of the Groups at the above Wards, which would undertake the task/s of activating the Ward Committees in their respective wards. It appeared that the proposed

changes in the system of governance were approved and endorsed, in principle, by all those who were present. To reconfirm the impression, those present were asked to show their approval by show of hands. It was seen that barring one person, the concept was approved by all present.

3.8 Some of the persons, who spoke on the occasion and the points they made, briefly stated, were as follows: -

Mr. Chandrashekhar Prabhu (Expert, Town Planning): After giving certain facts and figures, his main thrust and emphasis was on the vital importance of controlling the framing of "Master Development Plan". He emphasised that, unless the macro level planning was such as would promote planned, rational and scientifically viable development of the city, governance changes would not be very effective. He further stated that the changed provisions in the proposed law should be such as would make impossible any tampering with the Development Plan prepared by experts. Once this was assured, then, the Ward Committees would be able to function most effectively; and also the "Mayor" directly elected.

Mr. Madhu Sawant (Social Activist): He said that the area available for human habitation in Mumbai was so small that management of such a small area, if done bonafide and only in public interest would be very easy. He felt that formation of Ward Committees at Corporator Ward levels might provide a solution for effective management of areas covered by each Ward. He was also of the opinion that good productive work can be performed by the Corporator if there are effective checks in the system of governance.

Mr. Anil Chopra (Executive): He felt that modern principles of management must be adopted and applied in the governance of such a complex city like Mumbai. The structure proposed by LOKSATTA appears to provide that requirement.

Mr. Anand Desai: While appreciating the proposal of LOKSATTA regarding the structural changes, he wanted to know, what support LOKSATTA would be able to give to such citizen groups, who would take upon themselves the responsibility of forming Ward Committees and making them functional on the lines proposed by LOKSATTA. It was clarified that these issues of "detail" will be gone into with each of the Citizen Groups, whose wards will be selected for forming mock Ward Committees and used as laboratories to test the concept. The brief details of the proposed items of support by Lok Satta were also shown on PPT presentation and that included detailed mapping of each Local Area, Income and expenditure of BMC & its analysis in a given area, Physical infrastructure data in a given area, Volunteer training & orientation etc....

4. Resolution of Problems Created By Slums and Problems of Slum Dwellers:

4.1 There has never been any dispute over the proposition that the slums must go, but **not** the slum dwellers. Various efforts were already made in the past with some success stories. And yet, the problem appears intractable. This was mainly because the problem involved complex logistical issues, under development of rural India, want of political will, conflicting interests, - commercial, social and political.

4.2 LOKSATTA has proposed that all the concerned parties, viz. Central Govt., State Govt., Representatives of Slum Dwellers, other citizens of Mumbai, NGOs, Representatives of BMC, should be brought together on a common platform where all would be able to have free exchange of views. After assimilating these diverse views, logistical problems, a workshop may be conducted with specific agenda to find viable solutions and the time frame. Help from some expert bodies, Indian or foreign, could be sought in finding solutions. This concept is not new. World over democracies time & again have used these deliberative mechanism to arrive at win-win solutions. India being a vibrant democracy just fits in to this concept.

4.3 The concept proposed by LOKSATTA was well appreciated. It was also explained that the organisation called, Forum for Improving Quality of Life in Mumbai Suburbs ("IOQLMS"), in which Ms. Leena Prabhoo, Mr. Waman Danait, Jagdeep Desai and others were active, were willing to take upon themselves the onus of putting this concept in practice, with support of LOKSATTA and others. Some of the assembly spoke on this topic. What was said was: -

Col Ramesh Wasdeo: He was little apprehensive, whether the haves and have-nots will be willing to sit together?

Mr. Gautam Rao: He stated that although he was greatly disappointed with the functioning of SRA (Slum Rehabilitation Authority); there were sufficient laws on the subject of Slums and their rehabilitation. What was needed was the political will to enforce those laws or judicial orders, minus the proverbial judicial delays.

A lady journalist, Ms. Suchitra suggested that eco friendly cottage industries must be encouraged in rural areas to stop or minimise the migration to cities like Mumbai. This will lessen the burden on Mumbai of providing housing to those migrating to Mumbai daily in large numbers.

Ms. Leena Prabhoo, Mr. Waman Danait & Mr. Jagdeep Desai, who were present, made a note of these suggestions and would certainly take them into account when the exercise of creating a deliberative platform for finding the comprehensive solution would be undertaken.

Meeting was terminated at 12:45 hrs with vote of thanks to Father For providing the venue, Mr. Gordon D'Souza for his support in organizing this meeting and to all for participating.

Mumbai
15th Aug, 2005

Anant Shende
Lok Satta – Maharashtra Chapter
Chapter Coordinator

If India Wins – Who Loses!